# The free spectra of varieties generated by idempotent semigroups 

Gabriella Pluhár and Japheth Wood

Communicated by V. V. Kirichenko

Abstract. We give an exact formula for the logarithm of the free spectra of band varieties. We show that the the logarithm of the size of a free algebra in a band variety is $\frac{4}{(k-3)!} n^{k-3} \log n-$ $\frac{4}{(k-3)!} n^{k-3} \sum_{j=1}^{k-3} \frac{1}{j}+O\left(n^{k-4} \log n\right)$, where $k$ is a constant depending on the variety.

## 1. Introduction

For finite algebras there are strong connections between the structural properties of the algebra and the free spectra. If $\mathbf{G}$ is a finite group, then the size of the $n$-generated relatively free group in the variety generated by $\mathbf{G}$ is exponential in $n$ if and only if $\mathbf{G}$ is nilpotent, and doubly-exponential if $\mathbf{G}$ is not nilpotent ([12] and [18]).

Let $\mathbf{A}$ be an $m$-element finite algebra and let $\mathcal{V}$ denote the variety generated by $\mathbf{A}$. The free spectrum of a variety $\mathcal{V}$ is the sequence of cardinalities $\left|\mathbf{F}_{\mathcal{V}}(n)\right|, n=0,1,2, \ldots$ We can think of the free spectrum as the number of $n$-ary operations over $\mathbf{A}$. By the $p_{n}$ sequence of the variety we mean the number of essentially $n$-ary operations over $\mathbf{A}$. It is known that the size of the free algebra in $\mathcal{V}$ freely generated by $n$ elements $\left(\left|\mathbf{F}_{\mathcal{V}}(n)\right|\right)$ is at most $m^{m^{n}}$. If $m \geq 2$, then $\left|\mathbf{F}_{\mathcal{V}}(n)\right| \geq n$. For example, the free spectrum of Boolean algebras is $\left|\mathbf{F}_{\mathcal{V}}(n)\right|=2^{2^{n}}$. The first important question about free spectra is the following: Within the above bounds, what are the possible sequences?

Another theorem on free spectra is Theorem 12.3 in [13]: If $\mathcal{V}$ is a nontrivial locally finite congruence distributive variety, then for every constant $c$ such that $0<c<1$ and for every large $n$, the free spectrum of $\mathcal{V}$ is bounded below by $2^{2^{c n}}$. There are the so-called gap theorems for the free spectra as well. At the lower end, for example, there is Theorem 12.2 in [13]: Let $\mathcal{V}$ be a variety generated by a $k$-element algebra. Then either $\left|\mathbf{F}_{\mathcal{V}}(n)\right| \leq c n^{k}$ for some finite $c$, or else $\left|\mathbf{F}_{\mathcal{V}}(n)\right| \geq 2^{n-k}$ for all $n$.

For simple algebras there is a characterization of possible free spectra using universal algebraic techniques [2].

There are very few results on the free spectra of semigroup varieties. For a basic reference on the general properties of $p_{n}$ sequences for semigroups see [5]. A full description of finite semigroups for which the $p_{n}$ sequence is bounded by a polynomial is presented in [6]. A semigroup $S$ is called surjective if $S^{2}=S$. The aim of paper [5] is to prove that $p_{n}$ sequences of finite surjective semigroups are eventually strictly increasing, except in a few well-known cases, when they are bounded (by a constant). Semigroups with bounded $p_{n}$ sequences are described first in terms of identities, then structurally as nilpotent extensions of semilattices, Boolean groups and rectangular bands [4]. Kátai and Szabó in [16] continued the investigation of $p_{n}$ sequences from another direction. They investigated the $p_{n}$ sequences and free spectra of varieties generated by 0 -simple semigroups. Additionally, they showed in [15] that the free spectrum of the variety generated by all combinatorial 0 -simple semigroups is asymptotically $n^{2} 2^{n^{2}}$.

In the present paper, we investigate the free spectra of varieties of idempotent semigroups, the so-called bands. An estimate for the growth of the logarithm of the free spectra of band monoid varieties was given in [19]. We show that the the logarithm of the size of a free algebra in a band variety is $\frac{4}{(k-3)!} n^{k-3} \log n-\frac{4}{(k-3)!} n^{k-3} \sum_{j=1}^{k-3} \frac{1}{j}+O\left(n^{k-4} \log n\right)$, where $k$ is an invariant of the variety.

## 2. Terms and bands

For an algebra $\mathbf{A}$, the set of $n$-ary term operations is denoted by $\operatorname{Clo}_{n} \mathbf{A}$. Let $t=t\left(x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right)$ be an $n$-ary term. Then a term operation $t^{\mathbf{A}}$ is said to be essentially n-ary if it depends on all of its variables. That is, if for all $1 \leq i \leq n$ there exist $a_{1}, \ldots, a_{i-1}, a, b, a_{i+1}, \ldots, a_{n} \in A$ such that

$$
t\left(a_{1}, \ldots, a_{i-1}, a, a_{i+1}, \ldots, a_{n}\right) \neq t\left(a_{1}, \ldots, a_{i-1}, b, a_{i+1}, \ldots, a_{n}\right)
$$

For $n \geq 1$, denote the set of essentially $n$-ary term operations over $\mathbf{A}$ by $E_{n}(\mathbf{A})$, while $E_{0}(\mathbf{A})$ denotes the set of all constant unary term operations of $\mathbf{A}$. Now we define $p_{n}(\mathbf{A})=\left|E_{n}(\mathbf{A})\right|$.

The relation between the free spectrum of a variety and the number of essentially $n$-ary term operations is given by the formula $\left|\mathbf{F}_{\mathcal{V}}(n)\right|=$ $\left|\operatorname{Clo}_{n} \mathbf{A}\right|=\sum_{k=0}^{n}\binom{n}{k} p_{k}(\mathbf{A})$.

A band is an idempotent semigroup, that is a semigroup satisfying the identity $x^{2}=x$. Bands play an important role in semigroup theory. For a general reference about bands consult [14]. Varieties of bands were characterized from several aspects. The lattice of varieties of bands was independently described in [3], [7] and [8]. The lattice contains ten infinite sequences of varieties and seven varieties at the bottom of the lattice (see Figure 1). The varieties on the right and left sides of the figure are the join-irreducible varieties, and each one is generated by a single subdirectly irreducible algebra, called $\mathbf{A}_{i}, \mathbf{A}_{i}^{*}, \mathbf{B}_{i}, \mathbf{B}_{i}^{*}$. For their description see [10]. They are presented as a set of idempotent functions of the set $\{1,2$, $\ldots, i\}$. Every variety properly containing 3 is a join of (at most) two join-irreducible varieties. Each variety of bands is defined by a single identity (see [7]). For traditional reasons, the varieties in the middle are denoted by $3,3^{\prime}, 4,4^{\prime}, \ldots$, and the other two sequences are split into smaller sequences, which we denote by $\mathcal{U}_{3}, \mathcal{U}_{4}, \ldots, \mathcal{U}_{3}^{\prime}, \mathcal{U}_{4}^{\prime}, \ldots, \mathcal{U}_{3}^{*}, \mathcal{U}_{4}^{*}, \ldots$ and $\mathcal{U}_{3}^{* \prime}, \mathcal{U}_{4}^{* \prime}, \ldots$

## 3. Free spectra

The free spectra of the ten varieties at the bottom of the lattice are well-known.

Proposition 3.1. The free spectra of the bottom ten band varieties are the following

- $\left|F_{\mathcal{T}}(n)\right|=1$,
- $\left|F_{\mathcal{V}_{\left(A_{2}\right)}}(n)\right|=\left|F_{\mathcal{V}_{\left(A_{2}^{*}\right)}}(n)\right|=n$,
- $\left|F_{\mathcal{S}}(n)\right|=2^{n}-1$,
- $\left|F_{\mathcal{L N B}}(n)\right|=\left|F_{\mathcal{R N B}}(n)\right|=n 2^{n-1}$,
- $\left|F_{\mathcal{L R N}}(n)\right|=n^{2}$,
- $\left|F_{\mathcal{V}_{\left(B_{2}\right)}}(n)\right|=\left|F_{\mathcal{V}\left(B_{2}^{*}\right)}(n)\right|=\sum\binom{n}{k} k!$,


Figure 1: The Lattice of Band Varieties

- $\left|F_{3}(n)\right|=n(n+1) 2^{n-2}$.

For band varieties above this level the $p_{n}$ sequence of any equational class of bands, $\mathcal{V}$ can be calculated in the following way (see [9] Theorems 4.4 and 5.1).

Theorem 3.2. Let $\mathcal{V}$ be a variety of bands containing 3. Then

$$
p_{n}(\mathcal{V})=\sqrt{p_{n}(\overline{\mathcal{V}}) p_{n}(\underline{\mathcal{V}})},
$$

where $n \geq 0, \overline{\mathcal{V}}$ is the smallest variety of the form $k$ or $k^{\prime}$ containing $\mathcal{V}$ and $\underline{\mathcal{V}}$ is the largest class of this kind contained in $\mathcal{V}$. Moreover, in case $k \geq 3$ and $n \geq 0$ we have

$$
p_{n}\left(k^{\prime}\right)=\sqrt{p_{n}(k)} \sqrt{p_{n}(k+1)}
$$

Hence the following equations hold:
Corollary 3.3. The $p_{n}$ sequence of any band variety can be calculated with the $p_{n}(k)(k \geq 3, k \in \mathbb{N})$ sequences.
$p_{n}\left(\mathcal{V}\left(A_{k}\right)\right)=p_{n}\left(\mathcal{V}\left(A_{k}^{*}\right)\right)=\sqrt{p_{n}(k)} \sqrt{p_{n}(k+1)}$,
$p_{n}\left(\mathcal{V}\left(B_{k}\right)\right)=p_{n}\left(\mathcal{V}\left(B_{k}^{*}\right)\right)=\sqrt{p_{n}\left(k^{\prime}\right)} \sqrt{p_{n}\left((k+1)^{\prime}\right)}=$
$=\sqrt[4]{p_{n}(k) p_{n}^{2}(k+1) p_{n}(k+2)}$,
$p_{n}\left(\mathcal{U}_{k}\right)=p_{n}\left(\mathcal{U}_{k}^{*}\right)=\sqrt{p_{n}(k)} \sqrt{p_{n}\left(k^{\prime}\right)}=\sqrt[4]{p_{n}(k)^{3} p_{n}(k+1)}$,
$p_{n}\left(\mathcal{U}_{k}^{\prime}\right)=p_{n}\left(\mathcal{U}_{k}^{* \prime}\right)=\sqrt{p_{n}\left(k^{\prime}\right)} \sqrt{p_{n}(k+1)}=\sqrt[4]{p_{n}(k) p_{n}(k+1)^{3}}$.
Therefore, it is enough to calculate the values of $p_{n}(k)$ and from this we can easily calculate the free spectra of all band varieties.

For the $p_{n}$ sequence of the variety of (all) bands Gerhard introduced the notation $p_{n}(\infty)$. For $p_{n}(\infty)$ the following recurrence formula holds (see [11])

$$
\begin{equation*}
p_{n}(\infty)=n^{2} p_{n-1}^{2}(\infty) \tag{1}
\end{equation*}
$$

Moreover, $p_{1}(\infty)=1$, hence $p_{2}(\infty)=4, p_{3}(\infty)=144$, etc. For $p_{n}(k)$ the formula looks more complicated (see [9], and for a corrected version see [19]).

$$
\begin{equation*}
p_{n}(k)=n^{2} p_{k-2}^{2}(\infty) \prod_{j=k-1}^{n-1} j^{2} p_{j}(k-1), \text { for } n \geq k \geq 4 \tag{2}
\end{equation*}
$$

The initial values are

$$
p_{n}(3)=n^{2} \quad \text { and } \quad p_{n}(k)=p_{n}(\infty) \text { for } n<k
$$

Using (2) for $k$ and $k-1$, after division we obtain that

$$
\frac{p_{n}(k)}{p_{n-1}(k)}=n^{2} p_{n-1}(k-1), \text { for } n \geq k \geq 4
$$

We show that the formula holds for every $n$ and $k$. Indeed, if $k>n$, we can substitute $p_{n}(k)=p_{n}(\infty)$ and $p_{n-1}(k)=p_{n-1}(\infty)$ for one occurrence of $p_{n-1}(\infty)$ and $p_{n-1}(k-1)=p_{n-1}(\infty)$ for the other occurrence of $p_{n-1}(\infty)$ in (1). We obtain that

$$
p_{n}(k)=n^{2} p_{n-1}(k-1) p_{n-1}(k), \text { for } k>n, k \geq 4
$$

as well. Hence

$$
\begin{equation*}
p_{n}(k)=n^{2} p_{n-1}(k) p_{n-1}(k-1) \tag{3}
\end{equation*}
$$

holds in general for $n \geq 2$ and $k \geq 4$. Let $p(n, k)=\log p_{n}(k)$. Taking the logarithm of both sides of (3) we get

$$
\begin{equation*}
p(n, k)=2 \log n+p(n-1, k)+p(n-1, k-1) \tag{4}
\end{equation*}
$$

for $n \geq 2, k \geq 4$ and

$$
\begin{equation*}
p(n, 3)=2 \log n \quad \text { and } \quad p(1, k)=0 \tag{5}
\end{equation*}
$$

The explicit form of the solution of recurrence formula (4) with initial values in (5) is

$$
\begin{equation*}
p(n, k)=4 \sum_{m=1}^{n-1} \sum_{t=0}^{k-4}\binom{n-m-1}{t} \log m+2 \log n \tag{6}
\end{equation*}
$$

Theorem 3.4. Let $k \geq 4$. For the $p_{n}$ sequence of the band variety $k$

$$
\log p_{n}(k)=\frac{4}{(k-3)!} n^{k-3} \log n-\frac{4}{(k-3)!} n^{k-3} \sum_{j=1}^{k-3} \frac{1}{j}+O\left(n^{k-4} \log n\right)
$$

holds.
Proof. We keep the leading terms of the second summations in (6). Rewrite (6) as:

$$
\begin{aligned}
p(n, k)=4 \sum_{m=1}^{n-1}\binom{n-m-1}{k-4} \log m+ \\
+\left(4 \sum_{m=1}^{n-1} \sum_{t=0}^{k-5}\binom{n-m-1}{t} \log m+2 \log n\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

Write $\log n$ for $\log m$ in the error term, and use

$$
\begin{equation*}
\sum_{u=t}^{v}\binom{u}{t}=\binom{v+1}{t+1} \tag{7}
\end{equation*}
$$

Then we get

$$
p(n, k)=4 \sum_{m=1}^{n-1}\binom{n-m-1}{k-4} \log m+O\left(n^{k-4} \log n\right)
$$

Rewriting

$$
\begin{equation*}
\log m=\sum_{l=1}^{m} \frac{1}{l}-\gamma+O\left(\frac{1}{m}\right) \tag{8}
\end{equation*}
$$

we get

$$
p(n, k)=4 \sum_{m=1}^{n-1}\binom{n-m-1}{k-4}\left(\sum_{l=1}^{m} \frac{1}{l}-\gamma+O\left(\frac{1}{m}\right)\right)+O\left(n^{k-4} \log n\right)
$$

Changing the summations, applying (7), and observing for the error term that $\sum \frac{1}{m}\binom{n-m-1}{k-4} \leq n^{k-4} \sum \frac{1}{m}$, we get

$$
\begin{array}{r}
p(n, k)=4 \sum_{l=1}^{n-1} \frac{1}{l} \sum_{m=1}^{n-1}\binom{n-m-1}{k-4}-4 \gamma \sum_{m=1}^{n-1}\binom{n-m-1}{k-4}+ \\
+O\left(n^{k-4} \log n\right)= \\
=4 \sum_{l=1}^{n-1} \frac{1}{l}\binom{n-l}{k-3}-4 \gamma\binom{n-1}{k-3}+O\left(n^{k-4} \log n\right)
\end{array}
$$

Write $\binom{n-l}{k-3}=\frac{(n-l)^{k-3}}{(k-3)!}+O\left(n^{k-4}\right)$ to get

$$
\begin{equation*}
p(n, k)=\frac{4}{(k-3)!} \sum_{l=1}^{n-1} \frac{(n-l)^{k-3}}{l}-\frac{4 \gamma}{(k-3)!} n^{k-3}+O\left(n^{k-4} \log n\right) \tag{9}
\end{equation*}
$$

Expanding the numerators in the sum by the binomial theorem and keeping the leading terms only, (8) can be applied again, and we obtain

$$
\log p_{n}(k)=\frac{4}{(k-3)!} n^{k-3} \log n+O\left(n^{k-3}\right)
$$

If we want to arrive at a more accurate result, all coefficients have to be calculated in (9). Expanding the numerators by the binomial theorem, we get

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \frac{4}{(k-3)!} \sum_{l=1}^{n-1} \frac{(n-l)^{k-3}}{l}= \\
& =\frac{4}{(k-3)!} \sum_{l=1}^{n-1} \sum_{t=0}^{k-3}(-1)^{k-3-t}\binom{k-3}{t} \frac{n^{t} l^{k-3-t}}{l}= \\
& =\frac{4}{(k-3)!} \sum_{l=1}^{n-1}\left(\frac{1}{l} n^{k-3}+\sum_{t=0}^{k-4}(-1)^{k-3-t}\binom{k-3}{t} \frac{n^{t} l^{k-3-t}}{l}\right)= \\
& =\frac{4}{(k-3)!} n^{k-3} \sum_{l=1}^{n-1} \frac{1}{l}+\frac{4}{(k-3)!} \sum_{l=1}^{n-1} \sum_{t=0}^{k-4}(-1)^{k-3-t}\binom{k-3}{t} n^{t} l^{k-4-t} .
\end{aligned}
$$

Within the given error term, we obtain

$$
\frac{4}{(k-3)!} n^{k-3} \log n+\frac{4}{(k-3)!} \sum_{t=0}^{k-4} \sum_{l=1}^{n-1}(-1)^{k-3-t}\binom{k-3}{t} n^{t} l^{k-4-t}=
$$

$$
=\frac{4}{(k-3)!} n^{k-3} \log n+\frac{4}{(k-3)!} \sum_{t=0}^{k-4}(-1)^{k-3-t}\binom{k-3}{t} n^{t} \sum_{l=1}^{n-1} l^{k-4-t} .
$$

Now, let us substitute $\sum_{l=1}^{n-1} l^{k-4-t}=\frac{n^{k-3-t}}{k-3-t}+O\left(n^{k-4-t}\right)$.

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \frac{4}{(k-3)!} n^{k-3} \log n+\frac{4}{(k-3)!} \sum_{t=0}^{k-4}(-1)^{k-3-t}\binom{k-3}{t} n^{t} \frac{n^{k-3-t}}{k-3-t}+ \\
& +O\left(n^{k-4}\right)= \\
& =\frac{4}{(k-3)!} n^{k-3} \log n+\frac{4}{(k-3)!} \sum_{t=0}^{k-4}(-1)^{k-3-t}\binom{k-3}{t} \frac{n^{k-3}}{k-3-t}+ \\
& +O\left(n^{k-4}\right)= \\
& =\frac{4}{(k-3)!} n^{k-3} \log n+\frac{4}{(k-3)!} n^{k-3} \sum_{t=0}^{k-4}(-1)^{k-3-t}\binom{k-3}{t} \frac{1}{k-3-t}+ \\
& +O\left(n^{k-4}\right) \text {. }
\end{aligned}
$$

Let us examine the sum in the coefficient of $n^{k-3}$.
Substituting $m=k-3$ and $s=k-3-t$ into the formula

$$
\sum_{s=1}^{m} \frac{(-1)^{s}\binom{m}{s}}{s}=-\sum_{j=1}^{m} \frac{1}{j}
$$

(see Exercise 1.43(e) [17]) we obtain

$$
\log p_{n}(k)=\frac{4}{(k-3)!} n^{k-3} \log n-\frac{4}{(k-3)!} n^{k-3} \sum_{j=1}^{k-3} \frac{1}{j}+O\left(n^{k-4} \log n\right)
$$

The $p_{n}$ sequences and free spectra for the other band varieties can be calculated from Theorem 3.2 and Corollary 3.3.

Corollary 3.5. For the free spectra of any band varieties the following hold ( $k \geq 3, k \in \mathbb{N}$ ).

- $\log \left|\mathbf{F}_{k}(n)\right|=\frac{4}{(k-3)!} n^{k-3} \log n-\frac{4}{(k-3)!} n^{k-3} \sum_{j=1}^{k-3} \frac{1}{j}+O\left(n^{k-4} \log n\right)$,
$\bullet \log \left|\mathbf{F}_{k^{\prime}}(n)\right|=\log \left|\mathbf{F}_{\mathcal{V}\left(A_{k}\right)}(n)\right|=\left|\log \mathbf{F}_{\mathcal{V}\left(A_{k}^{*}\right)}(n)\right|=$
$=\frac{2}{(k-2)!} n^{k-2} \log n-\frac{2}{(k-2)!} n^{k-2} \sum_{j=1}^{k-2} \frac{1}{j}+O\left(n^{k-3} \log n\right)$,
- $\log \left|\mathbf{F}_{\mathcal{V}_{\left(B_{k}\right)}}(n)\right|=\log \left|\mathbf{F}_{\mathcal{V}_{\left(B_{k}^{*}\right)}}(n)\right|=$

$$
=\frac{1}{(k-1)!} n^{k-1} \log n-\frac{1}{(k-1)!} n^{k-1} \sum_{j=1}^{k-1} \frac{1}{j}+O\left(n^{k-2} \log n\right),
$$

- $\log \left|\mathbf{F}_{\mathcal{U}_{k}}(n)\right|=\log \left|\mathbf{F}_{\mathcal{U}_{k}^{*}}(n)\right|=$

$$
=\frac{1}{(k-2)!} n^{k-2} \log n-\frac{1}{(k-2)!} n^{k-2} \sum_{j=1}^{k-2} \frac{1}{j}+O\left(n^{k-3} \log n\right),
$$

- $\log \left|\mathbf{F}_{\mathcal{U}_{k}^{\prime}}(n)\right|=\left|\log \mathbf{F}_{\mathcal{U}_{k}^{* \prime}}(n)\right|=$
$=\frac{3}{(k-2)!} n^{k-2} \log n-\frac{3}{(k-2)!} n^{k-2} \sum_{j=1}^{k-2} \frac{1}{j}+O\left(n^{k-3} \log n\right)$.
Proof. From Theorem 3.2 and Corollary 3.3 it is straightforward to calculate the $p_{n}$ sequences of band varieties.
$\log p_{n}\left(k^{\prime}\right)=\log p_{n}\left(\mathcal{V}\left(A_{k}\right)\right)=\log p_{n}\left(\mathcal{V}\left(A_{k}^{*}\right)\right)=$
$=\frac{1}{2}\left(\frac{4}{(k-2)!} n^{k-2} \log n-\frac{4}{(k-2)!} n^{k-2} \sum_{j=1}^{k-2} \frac{1}{j}\right)+O\left(n^{k-3} \log n\right)$,
$\log p_{n}\left(\mathcal{V}\left(B_{k}\right)\right)=\log p_{n}\left(\mathcal{V}\left(B_{k}^{*}\right)\right)=$
$=\frac{1}{4}\left(\frac{4}{(k-1)!} n^{k-1} \log n-\frac{4}{(k-1)!} n^{k-1} \sum_{j=1}^{k-1} \frac{1}{j}\right)+O\left(n^{k-2} \log n\right)$,
$\log p_{n}\left(\mathcal{U}_{k}\right)=\log p_{n}\left(\mathcal{U}_{k}^{*}\right)=\frac{1}{4}\left(\frac{4}{(k-2)!} n^{k-2} \log n-\frac{4}{(k-2)!} n^{k-2} \sum_{j=1}^{k-2} \frac{1}{j}\right)+$ $O\left(n^{k-3} \log n\right)$,
$\log p_{n}\left(\mathcal{U}_{k}^{\prime}\right)=\log p_{n}\left(\mathcal{U}_{k}^{* \prime}\right)=\frac{3}{4}\left(\frac{4}{(k-2)!} n^{k-2} \log n-\frac{4}{(k-2)!} n^{k-2} \sum_{j=1}^{k-2} \frac{1}{j}\right)+$ $O\left(n^{k-3} \log n\right)$.

The estimation $\log p_{n}(\mathcal{V})<\log \left|\mathbf{F}_{\mathcal{V}}(n)\right|=\log p_{n}(\mathcal{V})+n \log 2$ is valid for any variety with monotone $p_{n}$ sequence, so $\log \mathbf{F}_{\mathcal{V}}(n)=\log p_{n}(\mathcal{V})+$ $O(n)$. This suffices, unless $\mathcal{V}$ is contained in the band variety 4 . The varieties contained in 4 have the following $p_{n}$ sequences:

$$
\begin{aligned}
& p_{n}(4)=n!^{4} / n^{2} \\
& p_{n}\left(\mathcal{U}_{3}^{\prime}\right)=p_{n}\left(\mathcal{U}_{3}^{* \prime}\right)=n!^{3} / n \\
& p_{n}\left(\mathcal{V}\left(A_{3}\right)\right)=p_{n}\left(\mathcal{V}\left(A_{3}^{*}\right)\right)=p_{n}\left(3^{\prime}\right)=n!^{2} \\
& p_{n}\left(\mathcal{U}_{3}\right)=p_{n}\left(\mathcal{U}_{3}^{*}\right)=n!n
\end{aligned}
$$

In each case we have $p_{n} \geq n p_{n-1}$ for every $n \geq 1$. So we obtain

$$
\begin{array}{r}
p_{n} \leq\left|\mathbf{F}_{\mathcal{V}}(n)\right| \leq \sum_{0}^{n}\binom{n}{t} p_{t} \leq \sum_{0}^{n}\binom{n}{t} p_{n} \frac{1}{n(n-1) \cdots(t+1)}= \\
=p_{n} \sum_{0}^{n} \frac{1}{(n-t)!} \leq e p_{n}
\end{array}
$$

Hence $\log \left|\mathbf{F}_{\mathcal{V}}(n)\right|=\log p_{n}(\mathcal{V})+O(1)$, so the error terms for $\log p_{n}(\mathcal{V})$ and for $\log \left|\mathbf{F}_{\mathcal{V}}(n)\right|$ have the same order of magnitude in the remainig cases as well.

We have proved that for band varieties the logarithm of the free spectra is asymptotically polynomial times $\log n$. This is just one step towards the main goal, the characterization of free spectra of semigroup varieties.

Problem. Classify the free spectra of semigroup varieties.

## 4. Acknowledgements

The authors are grateful to Árpád Tóth ([20]) and Antal Balog ([1]) for showing techniques of solving two variable recurrence formulas and techniques for estimating them. The research of the first author was supported by the Hungarian National Foundation for Scientific Research, Grants K67870 and N67867. The second author gratefully acknowledges the support of Bard College.

## References

[1] Balog, A., personal communication
[2] Berman, J., Free spectra gaps and tame congruence types, Int. J. Algebra Comput. 5 (1995), no. 6, 651-672.
[3] Biryukov, A. P., Varieties of idempotent semigroups, Algebra Logic 9 (1970), 153-164.
[4] Crvenković, S., Dolinka, I., Ruškuc, N., Finite semigroups with few term operations, J. Pure Appl. Algebra 157 (2001), no. 2-3, 205-214.
[5] Crvenković, S., Dolinka, I., Ruškuc, N., The Berman conjecture is true for finite surjective semigroups and their inflations, Semigroup Forum 62 (2001), 103-114.
[6] Crvenković, S., Ruškuc, N., Log-linear varieties of semigroups, Algebra Universalis 33 (1995), no. 3, 370-374.
[7] Fennemore, C., All varieties of bands, Math. Nachr. 48 (1971), 237-262.
[8] Gerhard, J. A., The lattice of equational classes of idempotent semigroups, J. Algebra 15 (1970), 195-224.
[9] Gerhard, J. A., The number of polynomials of idempotent semigroups, J. Algebra 18 (1971), 366-376.
[10] Gerhard, J. A., Some subdirectly irreducible idempotent semigroups, Semigroup Forum 5 (1973), 362-369.
[11] Green, J. A., Rees, D., On semigroups in which $x^{r}=x$, Proc. Cambr. Phil. Soc. 48 (1952), 35-40.
[12] Higman, G., The order of relatively free groups, Proc. Internat. Conf. Theory of Groups, Canberra 1965, Gordon and Breach Pub., 1967, 153-163.
[13] Hobby, D., McKenzie, R., The structure of finite algebras, Contemporary Mathematics, no. 76, Amer. Math. Soc., Providence, 1988.
[14] Howie, J.M., An introduction to semigroup theory, L.M.S. monographs, no. 7, Academic Press, London-New York, 1976.
[15] Kátai, K., Szabó, Cs., The free spectra of the variety generated by the completely 0-simple semigroups, Glasgow Journal of Mathematics, to appear (2007).
[16] Kátai, K., Szabó, Cs., The free spectra of exact varieties, manuscript (2006).
[17] Lovász, L., Combinatorial Problems and Exercises, Akadémiai Kiadó, Budapest, 1979.
[18] Neumann, P., Some indecomposable varieties of groups, Quart. J. Math. Oxford 14 (1963), 46-50.
[19] Seif, S., Wood, J., Asymptotic growth of free spectra of band monoids, Semigroup Forum, to appear (2007).
[20] Tóth, Á., personal communication

## Contact information

G. Pluhár Eötvös Loránd University, Department of Algebra and Number Theory, 1117 Budapest, Pázmány Péter sétány 1/c Hungary E-Mail: plugab@cs.elte.hu<br>\section*{J. Wood}<br>Bard College, MAT Program, PO Box 5000 Annandale-on-Hudson, NY 12504-5000<br>E-Mail: jwood@bard.edu

Received by the editors: 14.07.2008 and in final form 14.07.2008.

